

Ministry of Tourism,
Culture and Recreation

400 University Avenue
Toronto ON M7A 2R9

Conservation Review Board

Tel 416-314-7137

Fax 416-314-7175

Ministère du Tourisme,
de la Culture et des Loisirs

400, avenue University
Toronto ON M7A 2R9

Commission des

Biens culturels

TJl 416-314-7137

TJl 416-314-7175



**RE: TOWN OF OAKVILLE - INTENTION TO DESIGNATE
RAYDOR ESTATE HOUSE, 1333 DORVAL DRIVE, OAKVILLE**

Robert G. Bowes, Chairman
Heather R. Broadbent, Vice-Chairman

10 February 1993

Hearing pursuant to Section 29(8) of the Ontario Heritage Act R.S.O. 1990, Chapter O.18 of the Notice of Intention to designate 1333 Dorval Drive as being of historical and architectural value and interest.

Present:

Tricia Sinclair, Assistant Town Solicitor, Town of Oakville
Karen Hewson, Curator, RayDor Estate House
Ramona Boddington, Heritage Planner, Town of Oakville
Gloria Collier, Committee Assistant, Town of Oakville

The Conservation Review Board attended at the municipal offices in Oakville on February 10, 1993. The hearing was called to hear an objection to the proposed designation of 1333 Dorval Drive, under the Ontario Heritage Act, by the owner, the Royal Canadian Golf Association. As is its custom, the Board visited the site earlier in the morning of the hearing which was convened at 10:00 a.m.

Ms. Sinclair, representing the Town, informed the Board that officials of the municipality and the Golf Association had met earlier in the week and now had an agreement regarding the heritage designation of the subject building. The Town of Oakville approved a revised heritage report on the property at its meeting Monday night, February 8, 1993.

Ms. Sinclair informed the Board that the objection was not to the building being designated but was concerned with the scope of the designation; particularly with the amount of land to be included, and to references to the interior, which also appeared to relate to designation of these components. As a consequence, the Association filed an Objection. In the discussion between parties, the Town had been able to clarify its intentions and was now in agreement with the Association that only the exterior facade of the original structure would be designated and a new staff report was prepared.

Before calling a witness, Ms. Sinclair presented her *Exhibits* and they were entered into the record:

- 1 Affidavit from Nancy Smith, Secretary of the Conservation Review Board, Notice of Hearing published in the Oakville Beaver January 13, 20 and 27, 1993.
- 2 Revised Staff Report - Historical and Architectural significance and Reasons for Designation, 1333 Dorval Drive.
- 3 Confirmation of Ownership, Instrument 166095

The witness for the Town of Oakville, Ms. Ramona Boddington, was affirmed and Ms. Sinclair entered photographs of the building as *Exhibit 5*. Ms. Boddington had been working on preparation for designation and other responsibilities for Oakville LACAC for four years and was familiar with the building. In her evidence, she stated that it had been listed on the Town Inventory of historic structures since 1976 and was placed on the list of buildings for more detailed research in 1992.

History

In a review of the revised staff report on the building, Ms. Boddington described to the Board the education in Switzerland of French-born mining engineer Andre Dorfman (1887-1961) and his arrival in Canada in 1910. Employed first by McIntyre Porcupine Mines, he gained experience as a metallurgist and then moved to other opportunities in mining and metallurgy and the world of finance. He was a controlling figure in Huronia Belt, which merged with Keely Silver Mines and Vipond Consolidated to become Anglo-Huronian Limited. Other business enterprises were International Nickel (I.N.C.O.), Noranda and Kerr-Addison Gold Mines.

In the late 1930's the Dorfman family was interested in relocating to a rural property and purchased portions of four farms on the west side of Sixteen Mile Creek. The country estate referred to by his family as "the farm" was officially called "RayDor". The centrepiece of the property was the house which was the subject of the Board hearing. The stone building still exhibits the considerable expenditure of the Dorfman family to create their manor house. After fifteen years, in 1953 Andre Dorfman sold the estate at a preferential price to the Jesuits who renamed it the Loyola Retreat. The house became the Monastery.

In 1963 the Jesuits moved to another retreat at Guelph. Later that year a group of seven Oakville residents formed Clearstream Developments Limited and made a proposal for the property which included conversion to an 18-hole golf course.

Early in the 1970's, the Royal Canadian Golf Association sought a more suitable site for the Canadian Open, Canada's premiere annual golf event. Jack Nicklaus, internationally recognized golfer and course designer, designed an improved course for the property.

Architecture

The architectural style of the house was described as French Eclectic; probably chosen by the Dorfman family to recognize Mr. Dorfman's birthplace. Stylistically uncommon for North America, the house has a steeply pitched roof with slightly flared eaves and carved stone extension. The roof is clad in red clay tiles. The house has leaded windows with stone transoms and an elegant main entrance which includes a carved stone fruit bowl motif above elaborate oak doors.

In the staff report the contextual significance described the approach as still sympathetic to its original appearance during the Dorfman era. Ms. Boddington then explained that Oakville LACAC only recommended interiors for designation with owner consent and that, in this case, descriptions of interiors were included only as an item of general interest.

Ms. Boddington added that the addition was not considered significant and that it and a small stone building of similar construction to the original building but separated from it by the addition, were

not part of the designation recommendation. Further questions confirmed that the driveway was not included and that only the facade of the original house was mentioned in the recommendation to Council.

Karen Hewson, representing the Royal Canadian Golf Association, confirmed the comments of Legal Counsel for Oakville regarding the agreement between the Association and the Municipality. Ms. Hewson also stated that the staff report is incorrect in saying that Glen Abbey is the permanent home of the Canadian Open Golf Tournament. She informed the Board that the small stone building may not be original and that the Association did not want it or the addition designated. In answer to a question from the Board, neither Ms. Boddington or Ms. Hewson could confirm if the addition was architect designed.

Board Comments:

The Board was impressed with the historical association and architectural significance of the structure but also felt that the immediate context of the house reflected its significance, particularly its siting so close to the top-of-bank line of Sixteen Mile Creek.

The Board noted that the addition, although modern in layout and design and blended well with the original, was not visually incompatible with it, and has the appearance of being designed by a professional with an eye for the blending of dissimilar materials.

The Board was sympathetic with the objector's concern that the entire golf course or a large area around the building might be included in the designation. However, the Board was concerned that the proposed designation was restricted to the east, south and west facades and the roof. If a property envelope of some size is not associated with the designation of the house, then it becomes more difficult to preserve in the future when land-use or zoning changes might occur. In the Board's opinion, it would be more appropriate to include a small portion of land around the house. This can be accomplished by a registered plan or a metes and bounds survey and would basically create a suitably sized lot for such a large home, should a subdivision or other use be the ultimate fate of the golf course.

The Board was pleased to note the co-operation between both parties to resolve the impasse. Finally, the Board observed that the small stone building to the north of the main structure seemed to be of the same period as the original house, since its construction, workmanship and material were similar.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The Board recommends:

1. that RayDor Estate House be designated for its architectural and historical value;
2. that consideration be given to including in the designation a "heritage envelope", covering the immediate proximity of the house, which would adequately reflect its siting on the river bank and might include the rear gardens and oval drive, all of which reflect its historic status as an estate house;
3. that since it is the exterior of the building that is deemed to be important, the "Reasons" for designation refer to the specific walls and the roof, not the "exterior facade". Specific details of note such as the leaded casement windows with stone transom, the stone chimneys, etc. should also be listed in the "Reasons";

4. that since the distinctive character of a building evolves over time, consideration be given to including the entire exterior of the building in the property to be designated. However, the sympathetic modern addition could be specifically noted as excluded from the "Reasons" for designation;
5. that research be done on the small stone building to the immediate north of the main structure to determine whether it merits inclusion in the "Reasons" for designation.

(Signed)

Robert Bowes
Chairman

Heather Broadbent
Vice-Chairman