

**Ministry of Tourism,
Culture and Recreation**

400 University Avenue
Toronto ON M7A 2R9

Conservation Review Board

Tel 416-314-7137
Fax 416-314-7175

**Ministère du Tourisme,
de la Culture et des Loisirs**

400, avenue University
Toronto ON M7A 2R9

Commission des

Biens culturels
TJl 416-314-7137
TJl 416-314-7175



**RE: TOWN OF OAKVILLE - INTENTION TO DESIGNATE
2495 BRONTE ROAD, OAKVILLE, ONTARIO**

Heather Broadbent, Vice-Chairman
Barbara Humphreys, Member
Conservation Review Board

November 23, 1994

The hearing was convened at 1225 Trafalgar Road, Town of Oakville on November 23, 1994, pursuant to section 29(8) of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Ch. 0.18, for the purpose of reporting to the Council of the Town of Oakville whether, in the opinion of the Conservation Review Board, on the basis of the evidence heard, the property known municipally as 2495 Bronte Road, Oakville, should be designated by by-law under the Act. The owners of the property, Villa Greco Ltd., had objected through their lawyers O'Connor MacLeod. In addition, Mr. Kenneth Argue had objected to this and several other properties. Mr. Argue was again not present at the hearing.

Notice of the hearing was given under the Act in the *Oakville Beaver* newspaper on October 21 and 28, and November 4, 1994, by the Board, the relevant affidavit by a member of the Board's staff being Exhibit #1.

At the request of the owners, Board staff had attempted to coordinate a site visit with all parties in attendance however, at the last moment, Town representatives declined. As a consequence, the Board did not meet the owners on site as arranged but did view the building exterior before the hearing.

Beatrice Howell, Assistant Solicitor for the Town of Oakville, presented the case for the Town of Oakville. She called one expert witness, David Cuming, Consultant, Unterman, McPhail, Cuming Associates. There were no objectors present.

The Case for the Town of Oakville

Ms. Howell, presenting for Oakville, tabled a Staff Report and motion from the LACAC on the building, as Exhibit #2. Exhibit #3, a certified copy of the motion to designate 2495 Bronte Road from the Town of Oakville Council Minutes of January 18, 1993. In introducing David .../2

Cuming, B.Sc., DIP.T.P., MCIP, MRTPI, entered the report of Unterman McPhail Cuming Associates as Exhibit #4.

Other Presentations

Mr. David Cuming

Mr. Cuming's credentials were accepted by the Board, and the comprehensive report on the building was presented. It was noted that the Town of Oakville has designated over 100 individual properties under the Ontario Heritage Act, and two Heritage Districts. A third district is presently in the process. The municipalities criteria for designation are contained in the now Provincially approved Official Plan. The witness assured the Board that the proposed designation satisfies the intent of the Heritage Act; the Town's Official Plan policies and constitutes sound and prudent heritage conservation.

Objections

The Town received objections to the proposed designation through the owners' lawyers. Although not officially entered as an exhibit, a copy of this letter was available to the Board. It did not contain an objection on the historical and/or architectural significance of the structure. The second objection was from Mr. Argue.

Findings

The subject building is situated in the once thriving settlement of Palermo. Palermo is at the intersection of Dundas Street (Highway 5) and Bronte Road (Highway 25). After the Lawrence Foundry and Agricultural Works was established in 1842, the village prospered and by the 1870's contained, in addition to residential buildings, a wagon shop, blacksmith shop, harness shop, hotel, brick school house, several churches, telegraph company office and large drill-shed.

The house is the former residence and surgery of Dr. Anson Buck. Dr. Buck was the medical practitioner for the community and large surrounding area. Dr. Buck's history, medical training, army medical corps service, and public service record were exemplary. His medical and local government record, in Palermo alone, scanned forty years. He even designed a bridge erected over Bronte Creek. Dr. Buck died in 1919 and was buried in the Palermo United Church cemetery.

The two storey, red brick house, constructed in the 1860's in an "L" plan, is described as a good example of vernacular building with stylistic Italianate and Ontario Gothic influences. It has centre gables at the front and rear, bay windows with stone sills and lintels, and wide overhanging eaves. Decorative paired brackets adorn the eaves, and there are circular roof vents in the gables. Alterations include asphalt roof shingles, loss of the original verandas, and a paint colour changes.

.../3

Due to the drastic changes to the road network in Palermo, the building set-back has changed, but the relationship of the house to the highway has been maintained.

The building presently has a commercial zoning.

Conclusions

In spite of the alterations and additions, and the change in use of the building at 2495 Bronte Road, it is in excellent condition for a 130+ year old structure. The case is proven with regard to the importance and prominence of Dr. Anson Buck, first owner of the property. The building is of local architectural significance, in addition to its historical association with Buck and Palermo. The Board agrees with the evidence that it is a landmark and lasting reminder of the settlement of the community.

The owners' objections to the heritage designation are not clear. No evidence was offered at the hearing or to the Town of Oakville to indicate that the structure was insignificant for any of the reasons contained in the Ontario Heritage Act.

There seems to be no understanding of the fact that the building, standing as it does, deters the impact of future highway expansion, nor does it prevent development of adjacent land. It can be surrounded by its own lot in any future development.

Recommendations

The Board recommends to the Town of Oakville, that the heritage designation of 2495 Bronte Road, Oakville, be completed for historical, architectural, and contextual reasons, and as a fitting recognition of a prominent citizen.

(Signed)

Heather Broadbent
Vice-Chairman

Barbara Humphreys
Member

List of Exhibits

Exhibit

1. Affidavit of Notice of Hearing.
2. Staff Report, Town of Oakville, regarding the Heritage Designation of 2495 Bronte Road, dated January 7, 1993, also containing a Heritage Structure Report.
3. A certified copy of the Town of Oakville's Council Motion re the designation of 2495 Bronte Road.
4. The report prepared for the Town of Oakville by Unterman McPhail Cuming Associates respecting the designation of 2495 Bronte Road.
5. A copy of the deed and legal description of the property.