



Conservation  
Review Board

Commission des  
biens culturels

4th floor  
400 University Ave  
Toronto ON M7A 2R9  
Tel (416) 314-7137  
Fax (416) 314-7175

4e étage  
400 avenue University  
Toronto ON M7A 2R9  
Tél (416) 314-7137  
Télééc (416) 314-7175

Ministry of Tourism,  
Culture and Recreation

Ministère du Tourisme,  
de la Culture et des Loisirs

The Mayor and Members of Council  
The Town of Smiths Falls  
Municipal Offices  
77 Beckwith Street North  
Smiths Falls, Ontario  
K7A 4T6

January 15, 1993

Dear Mayor and Members of Council:

Re: Proposed Designation under Part IV  
of the Ontario Heritage Act of the  
Canadian Pacific Engine House  
(Roundhouse and Turntable)

Elizabeth Burnham - Chair

REPORT TO COUNCIL FOLLOWING HEARING HELD PURSUANT TO SECTION 29 (8) OF THE ONTARIO HERITAGE ACT, R.S.O. 1990. Chap.0. 18 AS TO WHETHER THE ABOVE PROPERTY SHOULD BE DESIGNATED UNDER THE ACT AS OF ARCHITECTURAL OR HISTORICAL VALUE OR INTEREST. (Date of Hearing: September 2, 1992)

Submissions were made by:

Kathy Coulthart-Dewey - Municipal Clerk, Town of Smiths Falls  
Harold Nichol - Chair of the Local L.A.C.A.C. Committee  
Bill LeSurf - representing the Smiths Falls Railway Museum  
Leo Jordan - M.P.P. Lanark Renfrew  
C.P.R -Philip Huband, Legal Department, C.P.R. Railway  
Barry Fields Superintendent, C.P.R. Railway - Quebec Division  
Jean Favreau Divisional Engineer, Quebec Division

The Town of Smiths Falls gave notice of intention to designate the property known as C.P. Railway Engine House (Roundhouse and Turntable) as being of architectural and historical value or interest. And following receipt of notice of objection from the C.P Rail and upon receiving an opinion from their solicitors for the Town that it was questionable as to whether any by-law passed by the town under the Ontario Heritage Act would have any application to the said railway property, the Town, therefore, passed a resolution withdrawing the intention to designate (Exhibit 3).

Where an objection to a proposed designation under the Ontario Heritage Act has been properly served within the statutory period and when the objection is not withdrawn, as in this case, subsection 29 (7) of the Act applies. This provision of the Act requires the council proposing the designation to refer the matter to the Conservation Review Board to hold a hearing under the Act and to make a report after the hearing to the Council. The Conservation Review Board, therefore, properly convened and held a hearing on the above matter, even though a copy of the notice of the withdrawal of the Town's intention to designate the said property was given to the Board by the Clerk of the Town of Smiths Falls. It is noted that the proper publications of notice of hearing were compiled with (Exhibit 1).

The solicitor for C.P.R. raised the question of the jurisdiction of the Conservation Review Board over federal property. Mr. Huband referred to The Railway Act and the opinion letter of the solicitors to the Town of Smiths Falls (Exhibit 3) regarding the authority of the municipality to pass a by-law affecting a federal property. He also drew the Board's attention to Issue Paper No. 3 The Legal Status of Ontario's Railway Stations as provided in the Ontario Heritage Foundation and Ministry of Culture and Communications railway information kit; an aid for the conservation of heritage railway stations.

The Board has sought legal opinion on this matter and been advised that it had jurisdiction to properly conduct a hearing under the Act.

The Conservation Review Board is required to conduct a hearing under the Ontario Heritage Act and to submit a report pursuant to subsection 29 (8) until it is given contrary advice by an order of a court of competent jurisdiction. The Board's substantive power is to investigate and make recommendations.

After considering the report of the Review Board, the Council of the Town of Smiths Falls may either pass a by-law designating the property or withdraw its Notice of Intention to Designate, Section 29 (14).

The solicitor for C.P.R. referred to the roundhouse and tracks as being part of the operational undertaking of the railway. Mr. Fields, Superintendent of the Quebec Division of C.P. Rail, who is responsible for the overall operation and management in the division which includes Smiths Falls, gave evidence on the present operation in Smiths Falls. The facilities in the roundhouse are used in work done for repair and maintenance of the line and railway. Crew members are housed in a building adjacent to the roundhouse, as this is a major point for changing crews between the cities of Montreal and Detroit. The roundhouse is adjacent to the main yard of the C.P. yard in Smiths Falls. The facility of the roundhouse was built in late 1886, during the steam days, and subsequently added to. C.P.R. feels that the roundhouse needs urgent and immediate repairs and their present plan is to destroy the roundhouse but keep one of the pits for the use of the railway. The roundhouse is no longer needed for their operations and with the costs of maintenance substantial and with their high projected cost to make it a safe structure, the C.P.R. proposes to tear down the building.

Mr. Favreau, the engineer for the C.P.R. (Quebec Division) responsible for all track and bridge and building general maintenance of the right of way, estimated that the cost of heat for the building was \$25,000 per year and said that in his opinion the current state of the building was very poor. There are original stones on the roundhouse, windows have been replaced, the posts on the side have been replaced by cement, posts and stringers are rotting, some have been replaced and three doors (timber) have to be replaced. They are major cracks in the outside of the wall, with costs of restoration in their opinion (C.P.R.) estimated between \$100,000 to 200,000.

Mr. Leo Jorden, MPP, for Lanark Renfrew, made no comment on the question of jurisdiction but wanted to point out the importance of the Smiths Falls Museum as a tourist attraction for the Town of Smiths Falls and area. He advised the hearing that he had been in communication with C.P.R. head office to see if he could make arrangements with the railway over the use of the buildings and area. He supported the importance of the roundhouse and track to the railway operations in the area for historic purposes.

Mr. Bill LeSurf appeared on behalf of the Smiths Falls Railway Museum and presented the extensive documents numbered I to 32 (a list of which is attached hereto in the list of exhibits) to support the historical and architectural importance of the C.P.R. engine house, roundhouse and turntable to the Town of Smiths Falls. His exhibits included heritage photos from the C.P.R. archives - and posters and 28 photos of the present roundhouse and turntable.

The historical information supplied by Mr. LeSurf firmly established in the opinion of the board the heritage value of the roundhouse and turntable. Smiths Falls was the divisional headquarters for the C.P.R. and the largest centre in Ontario - being part of the main line between Montreal and Toronto, and Montreal and Sudbury. The Smiths Falls Railway Museum presently operates the museum at the C.N.R. station and are anxious to obtain the engine house, roundhouse, and turntable to use as part of their historical railway project.

The Smiths Falls Railway Association presented the board a petition signed by 840 people to support the preservation of the C.P.R. roundhouse and turntable.

The Smiths Falls roundhouse appears to have been constructed in three stages. The first being a stone construction with curved concrete window end door stall entrance arches with three locomotive bay entrances and these were built around 1886 and proposals for addition to the original portion were started in 1904. The second roundhouse attached to the earlier stone roundhouse was constructed of poured concrete with two-foot poured concrete wall with rectangular frame windows. The plans for these were approved by the C.P.R. Engineering Department in 1907. The third roundhouse appears to be a separate seven-stall building engine house approved for construction in 1907 which has been demolished. The completed roundhouse had thirty-one locomotive stalls in all and the roundhouse or engine house had chimneys known as smoke jacks, one for each stall. The floors of the roundhouse were constructed of cement, cinders, stone and bricks. The roof is made of purlins, heavy wooden beams and supports, lateral rafters heavy beams and posts.

Several annexes form part of the roundhouse, the most important being the machine shop. Other annexes include the boiler room, foreman's office, sign-in room for engine crews and other staff, cafeteria, locker room, lavatory and store room. The arched windows and doorways in the original portion of work are constructed with large, poured concrete cornice stones and stone ashlar blocks. Each stall had a pit about 3 or 4 feet deep with steam pipes so work could be done under the engines, Radiating light came from the large multiple lighted windows built in two sections of 16 panes of glass and lower windows of 20 panes. These square windows were comprised of eight frames or 144 panes of glass opening to each stall. All sills are poured concrete -- many of the existing window walls have been filled with concrete blocks replacing the multi-paned windows. The roundhouse now consists of five radiating stalls with wooden door which swing open on large metal hinges. Three other doors have been encased with cinder blocks.

The 100-foot C.P.R. turntable situated outside the front of the roundhouse door pivots on a central bearing in a circular concrete walled pit open to the elements. This 100-foot wrought iron, trussed super structure was one of the largest turntables built in Canada. Being of a roller-bearing design it is basically a swing-bridge, pivoted at the centre and revolves horizontally about on a vertical axis.

Newspaper articles from the Record News of Smiths Falls were provided indicating the community interest in these buildings. Letters of support from Association of Railway Museums Inc., Royal Canadian Legion Branch No. 95, Smiths Falls, Brotherhood of Locomotive Engineers were filed as exhibits.

There was discussion and comment by both Mr. LeSurf and Mr. Huband on the state of the building itself. In summation, Mr. Huband raised the question of the state of repairs to the building and noted that while the building was now in use by the C.P. Rail the costs of repairs to the building would be substantial in order to maintain it. He queried the jurisdiction of the Review Board to conduct the hearing and questioned the authority of the municipality to designate the property, being railway lands.

The municipal clerk, Kathy Coulthart-Dewey, appearing on behalf of the Town of Smiths Falls, indicated that the town supported the historical importance of the C.P. roundhouse and turntable to the Town and the Town's position on the historical significance of the buildings had not changed even though it had passed the notice of withdrawal. Its withdrawal of intention to designate was based on their belief that they did not have the authority to designate the property. The withdrawal motion had been passed by council but had not been published. Mr. LeSurf, she noted, is regarded as a leading local railway authority and the council supports his statements on the historical value of the roundhouse and turntable. Mr. Nichol, on behalf of the local L.A.C.A.C. Committee stated that they approved and recommended designation of the property.

As is its custom, the board held an on-site inspection of the property, toured inside and outside the building, accompanied by the parties.

#### Recommendation

The board, in consideration of the evidence presented to it, concludes that the property is worthy of designation being of historical or architectural value and interest. The board is satisfied that the reasons for designation have been properly established and it recommends to council that they proceed with the designation.

It is noted that a recommendation of the board has no force or effect -- only a by-law of the Municipality can effect the designation of the property, pursuant to subsection 29 (14) of the Ontario Heritage Act.

(Original Signed by)

Elizabeth Burnham

Chair

**Exhibits - Conservation Review Board Hearing  
Canadian Pacific Railway Roundhouse  
& Turntable, Smiths Falls**

- Exhibit 1** Affidavit of Nancy Smith re publication of notice of hearing
- Exhibit 2** Tax Data Sheet Role No. & No.  
91 acre parcel of land  
only portion on which Rail House sits is subject to designation
- Exhibit 3** Declaration of Kathy Coulhart-Dewey - August 7, 14, 21, 91 Publication of Notice
- Exhibit 4** Chap. 3 Designating By-Law p.33 - 36 Designation Handbook & Guide book  
1974 by Dep. Cultural Com.
- Exhibit 5** August 11, 1992 Letter from Lawrence Friend Ex. Sec. to Bill LeSurf - (Smiths Falls Railway Museum Corp.)
- Exhibit 6** Smiths Falls Railway Museum documents (1 to 32)
1. Drafting of CPR Enginehouse and Turntable Apr, 1929
  2. SFRMC letter documenting historical facts July 24/91
  3. List of 26 remaining engine houses in Ontario = 26
  4. Town of Smiths Falls - Notice of withdrawal
  5. 70 page petition SFRMC - Save the. Roundhouse & Turntable Aug. 92
  6. 2 posters & 28 photos of present Roundhouse and Turntable
  7. Heritage photos CPR Enginehouse and Turntable - CPR
  8. Letter support, Leo Jordan, MPP Lanark Renfrew Aug 26/92
  9. Letter support - Heritage Canada Aug. 19/92
  - 9A Letter support - Heritage Canada to I.B. Scott Aug 14/92
  - 9B Letter support - Heritage Canada to M. Vaughan Mar 20/92

10. Letter from CP Limited from W.W. Stinson Aug 17/92
11. Letter from SFRMC to W.W. Stinson Aug 4/92
12. Letter support from Heritage Canada Feb 13/92
13. Letter support from Heritage Canada Jan 13/92
14. Letter from SFRMC to Mr. M. Vaughan July 28/92
15. Letter from SFRMC to Mary E. Bayer, CH HER CAN July 23/92
16. Letter support from Heritage Canada Aug 19/92
17. Record New Article- Roundhouse Could be Saved Aug 19/92
18. Letter support Royal Canadian Legion to L.R. Field Feb 21/92
19. History Smiths Falls - CPR Article History 1867-1967
20. Letter of Support Association of Railway Museums July 26/92
21. Whos Who - CPR Article Historic 1923
22. Record new article Historic Roundhouse May Face Demo Aug 14/92
23. CPR Legal Services letter to Historic Sites and Monuments Board giving 30 day notice of demolition Jul 20/92
24. Town of Smiths Falls re value industrial property Aug 26/92
25. Town of Smiths Falls Building Inspectors Report Aug 91
26. Letter support from David Gagnon Jun 1/91
27. Letter of support Brotherhood of Locomotive engineers Oct 11/91
28. Letter support United Transportation Union Lodge 456 Dec 89
29. Letter support United Transportation Union V.P. Dec 15/89
30. National Museum of Science and Technology Support Mar 13/89

31. Govt. Canada Dept. Communications Can. Conservation Inst. Aug 21/92
32. Algoma High Rail CPR Mag. re SFRM Gem in the Crown July 92
33. SFRMC letter to R.J. Ritchie Pres. CP Rail July 11/91
34. Poors manual of railways historical report 1914